

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

ATI LADISH LLC,

Plaintiff,

v.

WHEELTUG LIMITED, and  
WHEELTUG WORKS, LLC,

Defendants.

Case No. 1:23-cv-09108-DEH

**STIPULATION AND ORDER FOR  
THE EXCHANGE OF  
CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION**

This matter having come before the Court by stipulation of plaintiff, ATI Ladish LLC (“Plaintiff”), and defendants, WheelTug Limited and WheelTug Works, LLC (“Defendants”), for the entry of a protective order limiting the review, copying, dissemination and filing of confidential and/or proprietary documents and information to be produced by either party and their respective counsel or by any non-party in the course of discovery in this matter to the extent set forth below; and the parties, by, between and among their respective counsel, having stipulated and agreed to the terms set forth herein, and good cause having been shown;

IT IS hereby ORDERED that:

1. This Stipulation is being entered into to facilitate the production, exchange and discovery of documents and information that the parties agree merit confidential treatment (hereinafter the “Documents” or “Testimony”).

2. Either party may designate Documents produced, or Testimony given, in connection with this action as “Confidential,” either by notation on the document, statement on the record of the deposition, written advice to the respective undersigned counsel for the parties hereto, or by other appropriate means.

3. As used herein:

(a) “Confidential Information” shall mean all Documents and Testimony, and all information contained therein, and other information designated as confidential, if such Documents or Testimony contain trade secrets, proprietary business information, competitively sensitive information, or other information the disclosure of which would, in the good faith judgment of the party designating the material as confidential, be detrimental to the conduct of that party's business or the business of any of that party's customers or clients.

(b) “Producing party” shall mean the parties to this action and any third-parties producing "Confidential Information" in connection with depositions, document production or otherwise, or the party asserting the confidentiality privilege, as the case may be.

(c) “Receiving party” shall mean the party to this action and/or any non-party receiving “Confidential Information” in connection with depositions, document production or otherwise.

4. The Receiving party may, at any time, notify the Producing party that the Receiving party does not concur in the designation of a document or other material as Confidential Information. If the Producing party does not agree to declassify such document or material, the Receiving party may move before the Court for an order declassifying those documents or materials. If no such motion is filed, such documents or materials shall continue to be treated as Confidential Information. If such motion is filed, the documents or other materials shall be deemed Confidential Information unless and until the Court rules otherwise.

5. Except with the prior written consent of the Producing party or by Order of the Court, Confidential Information shall not be furnished, shown or disclosed to any person or entity except to:

(a) personnel of Plaintiff or Defendant actually engaged in assisting in the preparation of

this action for trial or other proceeding herein and who have been advised of their obligations hereunder;

(b) counsel for the parties to this action and their associated attorneys, paralegals and other professional personnel (including support staff) who are directly assisting such counsel in the preparation of this action for trial or other proceeding herein, are under the supervision or control of such counsel, and who have been advised by such counsel of their obligations hereunder;

(c) expert witnesses or consultants retained by the parties or their counsel to furnish technical or expert services in connection with this action or to give testimony with respect to the subject matter of this action at the trial of this action or other proceeding herein; provided, however, that such Confidential Information is furnished, shown or disclosed in accordance with paragraph 7 hereof;

(d) the Court and court personnel, if filed in accordance with paragraph 12 hereof;

(e) an officer before whom a deposition is taken, including stenographic reporters and any necessary secretarial, clerical or other personnel of such officer, if furnished, shown or disclosed in accordance with paragraph 10 hereof;

(f) trial and deposition witnesses, if furnished, shown or disclosed in accordance with paragraphs 9 and 10, respectively, hereof; and

(g) any other person agreed to by the parties.

6. Confidential Information shall be utilized by the Receiving party and its counsel only for purposes of this litigation and for no other purposes.

7. Before any disclosure of Confidential Information is made to an expert witness or consultant pursuant to paragraph 5(c) hereof, counsel for the Receiving party shall provide the expert's written agreement, in the form of Exhibit A attached hereto, to comply with and be bound

by its terms. Counsel for the party obtaining the certificate shall supply a copy to counsel for the other party at the time of the disclosure of the information required to be disclosed by, except that any certificate signed by an expert or consultant who is not expected to be called as a witness at trial is not required to be supplied.

8. All depositions shall presumptively be treated as Confidential Information and subject to this Stipulation during the deposition and for a period of fifteen (15) days after a transcript of said deposition is received by counsel for each of the parties. At or before the end of such fifteen-day period, the deposition shall be classified appropriately.

9. Should the need arise for any of the parties to disclose Confidential Information during any hearing or trial before the Court, including through argument or the presentation of evidence, such party shall notify all other parties and only upon a showing of good cause, will the information be deemed confidential. Such a showing may be made by application to the court by motion or order to show cause.

10. This Stipulation shall not preclude counsel for the parties from using during any deposition in this action any documents or information which have been designated as “Confidential Information” under the terms hereof. Any court reporter and deposition witness who is given access to Confidential Information shall, prior thereto, be provided with a copy of this Stipulation and shall execute the certificate annexed hereto. Counsel for the party obtaining the certificate shall supply a copy to counsel for the other party.

11. A party may designate as Confidential Information subject to this Stipulation any document, information, or deposition testimony produced or given by any non-party to this case, or any portion thereof. In the case of Documents, designation shall be made by notifying all counsel in writing of those documents which are to be stamped and treated as such at any time up to fifteen

(15) days after actual receipt of copies of those documents by counsel for the party asserting the confidentiality privilege. In the case of deposition Testimony, designation shall be made by notifying all counsel in writing of those portions which are to be stamped or otherwise treated as such at any time up to fifteen (15) days after the transcript is received by counsel for the party asserting the confidentiality privilege. Prior to the expiration of such fifteen (15) day period (or until a designation is made by counsel, if such a designation is made in a shorter period of time), all such documents shall be treated as Confidential Information.

12. A Receiving Party who seeks to file with the Court any deposition transcripts, exhibits, answers to interrogatories, and other documents which have previously been designated as comprising or containing Confidential Information, and any pleading, brief or memorandum which reproduces, paraphrases or discloses Confidential Information, shall provide all other parties with seven (7) days' written notice of its intent to file such material with the Court, so that the Producing Party may file by Order to Show Cause a motion to seal such Confidential Information asserting good cause for such sealing. The Confidential Information shall not be filed until the Court renders a decision on the motion to seal. In the event the motion to seal is granted, all documents which are the subject of the order to seal, shall be filed in sealed envelopes or other appropriate sealed container on which shall be endorsed the caption of this litigation, the words "CONFIDENTIAL MATERIAL- SUBJECT TO STIPULATION FOR THE PRODUCTION AND EXCHANGE OF CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION" as an indication of the nature of the contents, and a statement in substantially the following form: "This envelope, containing documents which are filed in this case by (name of party), is not to be opened nor are the contents thereof to be displayed or revealed other than to the Court, the parties and their counsel of record, except by order of the Court or consent of all the parties. Violation hereof may be regarded as contempt of the Court." All pleadings, briefs

or memoranda which reproduce, paraphrase or disclose any documents which have previously been designated by a party as comprising or containing Confidential Information, shall identify such documents by the production number ascribed to them at the time of production.

13. Any person receiving Confidential Information shall not reveal or discuss such information to or with any person not entitled to receive such information under the terms hereof.

14. Any document or information that may contain Confidential Information that has been inadvertently produced without identification as to its “confidential” nature as provided in paragraphs 2 and/or 11 of this Stipulation, may be so designated by the party asserting the confidentiality privilege by written notice to the undersigned counsel for the Receiving party identifying the document or information as “confidential” within a reasonable time following the discovery that the document or information has been produced without such designation.

15. Extracts and summaries of Confidential Information shall also be treated as confidential in accordance with the provisions of this Stipulation.

16. The production or disclosure of Confidential Information shall in no way constitute a waiver of each party’s right to object to the production or disclosure of other information in this action or in any other action.

17. This Stipulation is entered into without prejudice to the right of either party to seek relief from, or modification of, this Stipulation or any provisions thereof by properly noticed motion to the Court or to challenge any designation of confidentiality as inappropriate under the Civil Practice Law and Rules or other applicable law.

18. The provisions of this Stipulation shall, absent prior written consent of both parties, continue to be binding after the conclusion of this action, except:

(a) that there shall be no restriction on documents that are used in Court (unless such

exhibits are permitted by court order to be filed under seal or redacted); and

b) that a party may seek the written permission of the Producing party or further order of the Court with respect to dissolution or modification of the Stipulation.

19. Nothing herein shall be deemed to waive any privilege recognized by law or shall be deemed an admission as to the admissibility in evidence of any facts or documents revealed in the course of disclosure.

20. Within sixty (60) days after the final termination of this litigation by settlement or exhaustion of all appeals, all Confidential Information produced or designated and all reproductions thereof, shall be returned to the Producing Party or shall be destroyed, at the option of the Producing Party. In the event that any party chooses to destroy physical objects and documents, such party shall certify in writing within sixty (60) days of the final termination of this litigation that it has undertaken its best efforts to destroy such physical objects and documents, and that such physical objects and documents have been destroyed to the best of its knowledge. Notwithstanding anything to the contrary, counsel of record for the parties may retain one copy of documents constituting work product, a copy of pleadings, motion papers, discovery responses, deposition transcripts and deposition and trial exhibits. This Stipulation shall not be interpreted in a manner that would violate any applicable canons of ethics or codes of professional responsibility. Nothing in this Stipulation shall prohibit or interfere with the ability of counsel for any party, or of experts specially retained for this case, to represent any individual, corporation, or other entity adverse to any party or its affiliate(s) in connection with any other matters. Furthermore, notwithstanding anything herein to the contrary, the parties agree that deletion of electronic copies of their respective Confidential Information shall be subject to any of Fox Rothschild LLP and/or Condon & Forsyth LLP's routine data backup and retention policies, and

that the actual deletion of such Confidential Information may occur as such backup media is overwritten and as part of such retention policies; provided that at all times such Confidential Information will be treated in accordance with the terms of this Stipulation.

21. This Stipulation may be changed by further order of this Court and is without prejudice to the rights of a party to move for relief from any of its provisions, or to seek or agree to different or additional protection for any particular material or information.

Respectfully submitted,

FOX ROTHSCHILD LLP

/s/ Alexandra L. Sobol  
Alexandra L. Sobol  
101 Park Avenue, 17<sup>th</sup> Floor  
New York, New York 10178  
Telephone: (212) 878-7900  
Facsimile: (212) 692-0940  
re

-and-

John R. Gotaskie, Jr.  
*Admitted Pro Hac Vice*  
Luciana R. Liddell  
*Admitted Pro Hac Vice*  
BNY Mellon Center  
500 Grant Street, Suite 2500  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219  
Telephone: (412) 391-1334  
Facsimile: (412) 391-6984  
[JGotaskie@FoxRothschild.com](mailto:JGotaskie@FoxRothschild.com)  
[LSena@FoxRothschild.com](mailto:LSena@FoxRothschild.com)

*Attorneys for Plaintiff ATI Ladish LLC*

CONDON & FORSYTH LLP

/s/ John Maggio  
John Maggio  
Brittany Thomas  
7 Times Square, Suite 1800  
New York, New York 10036  
Telephone: (212) 490-9100  
Facsimile: (212) 370-4453  
[BThomas@condonlaw.com](mailto:BThomas@condonlaw.com)  
[JMaggio@condonlaw.com](mailto:JMaggio@condonlaw.com)

*Attorneys for Defendants WheelTug  
Limited and WheelTug Works, LLC*

Dated: April 15, 2024

The parties are reminded that the Court retains the discretion to allow disclosure of any subject covered by this stipulation or to modify this stipulation at any time in the interest of justice.

**SO ORDERED:**

Date: April 16, 2024



Hon. Dale E. Ho

United States District Judge

8 New York, New York